

March 24, 2014

Mayor Jenkins opened the regular meeting of the Gaylord City Council with prayer by Council Member Sharrard at 7:00 p.m. on Monday, March 24, 2014, in the City Council Chambers, located in the Gaylord City Hall, 305 East Main Street, Gaylord, Michigan. The Pledge of Allegiance followed the invocation.

Members Present: Campbell, Duczkowski, Jenkins, Johnson, Mankowski and Sharrard.

Members Absent: Wishart.

Motion by Campbell, supported by Duczkowski, to dispense with the reading of the minutes of the previous meeting and to accept them as presented.

Ayes: Unanimous. Motion carried.

DDA Executive Director Justin Burchett gave a power point presentation on Community Placemaking and the proposed Renaissance Streetscape Project.

Mayor Jenkins then entertained questions relating to the project. DDA Executive Director Burchett and Otsego County Economic Alliance Director Jeff Ratcliffe along with Amanda Poynter from C2AE responded to questions regarding the project. A synopsis of questions are as follows:

- Dave Platte, 117 West Petoskey Street: Are you going to reroute truck traffic around Main Street?
- Jim Akans, Alpenfrost Committee and Gaylord Historical Society: Applaud the Committee's work. Will there be a chance to look at the elements, like the courthouse and gateways?
- Deb Ferguson, 883 West Otsego Lake Drive: Where is Alpenfest going to be and are you going to make buildings not look like Alpine? Are you going to take it all away and make it modern?
- Vic Ouelette, 418 North Otsego Avenue: Can someone explain local government and the \$900,000? During Alpenfest all traffic is diverted, Mitchell, Petoskey, First Street. What steps are you going to take to protect side streets?
- Earl Henry, Mt. Jack Road: What is it going to cost the average citizen in Otsego County?
- Mary Mulka, 302 East First Street: Plans change and would like that in writing (in response to the answer to Mr. Henry's question). All streetscapes in the presentation have water. Petoskey has empty storefronts. Shouldn't we figure out how to get downtown full first?
- Kyle Dennison, McCoy Road: Can't survive rents now and is afraid rents are going to get higher. How is project going to improve this?
- Scott Lampert, 302 North Elm Avenue: Are the studies provided independent studies? Has data been provided by statistics on improvements in other communities?
- Jim Flint, 217 East Sheldon Street: What is the current level of air pollution and decibels of noise? What standards are you using?
- Joanne Goldsborough, 480 Nottingham: Are there studies that show how this is beneficial to a community comparable to Gaylord?
- Bob Dumas, Sugar Bowl Restaurant, 216 West Main Street: Why are we here? Where is the money coming from?
- Judith Schroeder, 510 East Main Street: How will extra traffic on Mitchell Street affect student drop off and pick up at St. Mary's? If there is angle parking, how will cars get out?
- Dave Platte, 117 West Petoskey Street: Where is the money coming to maintain the project?

- Chad Edwards, 349 East Main Street: Could Gaylord be held responsible if there is an accident (if nothing is done)?
- Penny Martin, Coney Island, 109 East Main Street: This will help in the future. Will we do something different about snow? There is so much now.
- Bob Doumas, Sugar Bowl Restaurant, 216 West Main Street: If 3-lanes and a delivery comes, does all traffic have to stop?
- Chris Cherry, 117 West Sixth Street: More jobs? Are they going to be full or part-time minimum wage jobs? Couldn't we spend money somewhere else to bring in jobs?
- Dutch Nuebecker, 121 Felshaw Street: Has there been numbers that show the reduction of heavy trucks in the downtown?
- Fenner Goldsborough, 480 Nottingham: Will the names of those who contribute the \$900,000 be disclosed?

Being no further questions, Mayor Jenkins recessed the meeting at 8:25 p.m. and reopened the meeting at 8:34 p.m.

Mayor Jenkins opened the public hearing on the Renaissance Streetscape Project. Public comment was solicited, with each comment limited to two minutes in duration. Following is a synopsis of public comments received. A complete recording of the public comment may be obtained upon request as well as all letter and communications received or reports made part of the record.

- Barry Owens, 9821 Nekomis Trail, Treetops Resort: I work at Treetops and I am the General Manager of Treetops and also on the Gaylord Area Convention and Visitors Bureau Board. Both Treetops and the Convention and Visitors Bureau Board solely and wholeheartedly endorse this program and it is important for our community and hospitality industry. Our industry generates about \$100-million in direct and indirect revenue, about 400,000 visitors to Otsego County. Just last year alone we had over \$50-million in room and golf revenue and I hear some of the comments about what is there to come to Gaylord for and it just shocks me. I am proud to say that I am also serve as the co-chair for the Pure Michigan strategic plan and I think we are a much bigger pot than we think we are and much bigger fish than we think we are. There were 950 courses in Pure Michigan felt to do the golf commercial and they chose to do it in Gaylord at Treetops. We currently have a partnership where we're partnered with Pure Michigan and Cherry Capital Airport to try and bring golfers in from Dallas, Texas when it is 110 degrees in July and August and they bring results and they want to know what there is to do a lot more than just playing golf and what is going on around our community and everything else. So, it is imperative to our industry, we sell Gaylord all the time in all our things. I had a discussion with a friend of mine and he said "hey, what is wrong with the status quo, why can't we stay where we are at"? And somebody taught me a long time ago there is no status quo, you are either moving forward or moving backwards and if we don't move forward we are going to move backwards.
- Bob Doumas, Sugar Bowl Restaurant, 216 West Main Street: And I feel wonderful to see all these people that are concerned in Gaylord. Everything City Council does tonight will impact us for a long period of time. Some of the things I want to say, I won't. Many of the questions have been answered, other questions are not going to be answered. Just remember one thing City officials, everything you do here tonight, right or wrong, is going to impact this City for the next 25-50 years. Thank you.

- Abby and Ryan Hamilton, 400 West Main Street and 321 East Main Street, Advantage Audiology and Guardian Gals: Together, we own and operate Advantage Audiology and Hearing Center, at 400 West Main Street, where we serve predominantly an elderly population. I'm Founder and CEO of Guardian Gals, a nonprofit mentoring organization that works diligently to empower adolescent and grown women and to be positive change agents, local commerce supporters, while encouraging their pedestrian traffic by foot and bicycle within the city limits. Most importantly, we are charged with raising three of your youngest citizens, our children, who we desire to provide the very safest and most engaging childhood. Our political system is a representative democracy. You've been elected by Gaylord city residents to make decisions on our behalf. Your responsibility to our family and both, our voting residential neighbors and non-voting downtown business and building owners, is to represent, collectively, our best interests and search for a solution that moves the city of Gaylord forward. Tonight you are charged with making a decision in Gaylord's best interest. Tonight, much has been presented to you. The most critical part of your job and proof of your legacy as a decision making body is to ensure the 2009 Otsego County Strategic Plan is adhered to and advanced. This plan has already been created and approved by the people via an engaged, public input hearing. This plan advises you: Under Community Services: Transportation: Item 4a. Work with MDOT to plan for vehicular and pedestrian safety at intersections and on roadways. Item 8, Provide design guidelines for communities within Otsego County to promote a pedestrian, bicycle, and neighborhood electric vehicles oriented community. Under Health Services: Item 1. Encourage facilities for senior and special needs citizens, including a continuum of care facilities, and elder friendly housing within close proximity to neighborhood shopping facilities, pedestrian walkways, and parks and rec facilities. Item 2. Ensure that health facilities, programs, and systems are consistent with the community's needs and determine ways to finance expansion if necessary Item 2a. Support hospitals, clinics, and other health-care facilities (such as our Audiology practice) in efforts to keep pace with medical demands Item 2c. Adopt policies to encourage and attract doctors, nurses, and health care professionals (such as Doctors of Audiology). Under Recreation: Item 1. Facilitate the improvement of recreation in Otsego County Item 1b. Develop comprehensive park system including mini-parks and neighborhood parks to meet the needs of existing and future Otsego County residents and visitors Item 1d. Develop well-maintained, coherent network of sidewalks, bike paths, pedestrian ways, open spaces, parks and playgrounds, and street design to encourage creative design and re-design of neighborhoods to enhance desirability Item 1 g. Set aside suitable portions of land for neighborhood parks and road easements for pedestrian and bicycle paths Item 2. Develop a complete system of trails and pathways with safe access to businesses and services This project, created collaboratively with Abby and over 20 volunteer committee members' contributions addresses legitimate responsibilities that you are responsible to us for as your constituents and it does so while creatively and enthusiastically incorporating new expressions, appreciation for what has already been established here, and while representing the thoughts, actions, facts, and feelings of individuals who hold stake here and expect finer standards of living. We fully support efforts of the Gaylord Downtown Renaissance project and encourage each of you to be brave enough to vote in favor of a resolution of a project that partially fulfills your strategic plan and duties to make Gaylord and Otsego County a more vibrant and safe place for citizens like us to live.
- Glen B. Catt, 829 West Main Street, Catt Realty: Whether you like placemaking or understand the reality of that it is the trend. I have been able to work with a lot of small communities in Michigan where this has had a lot of success. People with active lifestyles want to be able to walk to and from business and bike in the downtown. That is something you see in Boyne City, Bellaire, you

see in Traverse City, you can see in Howell. I don't know how many have been to Howell but that is one of the greatest success stories of what a downtown can be. Gaylord will never have a quaint downtown as long there is a divided highway going through. Gaylord has tourism and great resorts, lots of great golf, and a tremendous amount of outdoor recreational opportunities, biking, snowmobiling, ATV's, all that kind of stuff. I think we could be much more than a regional shopping destination and this is heading in the right direction.

- Mary Mulka, 302 East First Street: We have been lived here 22 years. We have raised our children and worked in this community. We love our community and have wonderful neighbors. My comment was not to the City of Gaylord or any of the shops or businesses that are here. My comment if you remember was watching the other communities that have streetscapes that have different things that pull them to the downtown. I don't mean the restaurants and the stores and that, I mean they had scenic, unique other other features added to their shops that made their downtown more desirable. I am not seeing that our downtown has any kind of that the scenic thing even though we have great things, great stores, and great restaurants to go to. So I need to clarify that in no way I am downing any part of Gaylord, or businesses or restaurants or anything. I love it here, we have lived here this long. It was just in reference to what you were trying to show us to make it clear that you want the downtown streetscape which I understand, but those are the elements that concern me. I grew up in Petoskey, I know the whole dynamic of having water, and I understand that, so I needed to clear that up.
- Kristin Lubs Eagle, 321 East First Street: I fully support the efforts of the downtown Renaissance Project and encourage each of you to be courageous enough tonight to vote in favor of a resolution of a project that partially fulfills your strategic plan that needs to make Gaylord a great place for my family to live. I recently opened a counseling practice in Gaylord off of Main Street. If you keep doing what you're doing you will keep getting what you're getting. I support the downtown Renaissance mainly because I see business owners who are staying. Let's try something different. It is important to invest in our local business owners. When I see the plans for the downtown Renaissance project I see attractions that appeal to visitors as well as our local residents.
- Bruce Brown, Alpine Chocolate Haus, 574 Hayes Tower Road: Been here since 1985. When I came my location was four doors down from where I am now. When I came in 1985 my rent was \$7.20 a square foot. I had a good talk with a friend of mine on Thursday and we were talking about some of the buildings downtown and Audrain's building right now. And I called the owner after talking to this person and he is asking \$6.00 a square foot. We have gone backwards in the 29 years I have been here. Mr. Doumas is right if you don't do something or say no then the downtown is going to stay like it is. Right now if you go downtown we don't have quality shops. We need businesses, we need to make it pedestrian friendly. The comment was how it is safe. We hear in our store how people don't like the highway. How they don't like to cross the street and I know one of my employees helped Mr. Doumas cross the street because of how dangerous it is. He is right if you vote no tonight then the next 25 years, then downtown Gaylord is going to stay downtown Gaylord. If you don't move forward than I am sorry, we are going to be in trouble.
- David Miner, OMH and Saturn Booksellers, 133 West Main Street: We came here in 1996. I came out of a unit in the Navy, I could have gone anywhere in the country. We chose Gaylord because we love the community. My wife and I own a building downtown and have a business there. In

the time that we have been here now, nearly 20 years, the downtown has faded and it is time to move forward. If you don't move forward you move backwards.

- Kristie Perdue, 250 Guenther Ridge: For myself personally it comes down to safety. There has been a lot of discussion whether the downtown is safe or not. The reality is I won't take my 3-year old down there because if she lets go of my hand I don't know what will happen to her. And whether there has been a tragedy or not or whatever the argument is the design that is proposed will make the downtown safer. There will be less traffic, there will be wider sidewalks so pushing everything aside, all of the other great arguments for doing this project it will be safer. I really encourage you as Council Members and we as a community to think about my daughter's safety, all the children's safety and the future.
- Chad Edwards, Bearded Dogg, 302 South Otsego Avenue and 329 East Main Street: I've been here most of my life. I live right over there. I love downtown Gaylord and have always wanted to be downtown. I have had the same issues, I have been hit twice. I own the Bearded Dogg and I try to walk to work, I have been hit twice. I don't walk to work and it is only four blocks. I don't want to walk across the street. I know people who get into their car, drive to cross the street then get out because it is so dangerous. What is the value of a human life? What's the value of a child? We need to do something. As far as attractions downtown, there really isn't a whole lot. I think the courthouse lawn would help people and Main Street. Look at the ice tree that is going to be here until July, and all the people taking pictures. What a wonderful thing to see in our community. And I think this is going to do it and I think it is going to be more of a permanent solution. And I think it is going to attract another type of person into our community and it is going to be fantastic. Thank you to the boards who put this together, thank you for coming out here tonight. I love seeing the opposition for it, I think it raises awesome questions.
- Dale Gehman, Commission on Aging, 544 East Petoskey Street: Personally I support the project. I think it is what we need. Economically it is what we need for shopping, it is going to be a good thing downtown. Also I am director of the Otsego County Commission on Aging. Have been watching the census. We are 24% senior citizens now in this area, in Otsego County. We at the Commission on Aging have been part of the Communities for a Lifetime project which is about making our downtowns friendlier and more accessible, safer for our senior citizens. This project fits very nicely with that. Our board is in support of this and it is a great project.
- Barbara Brown, 574 Hayes Tower Road: I am a school employee, I am the wife of a downtown business owner. I am on the board of the Otsego County Community Foundation. I personally try not to drive downtown. It is not safe. I know people who have gotten hit trying to get out of their car. We need to do something to make it safer. I also would like to do some clarification. It is my understanding that the courthouse lawn project is a totally separate project from the streetscape project. It just happens to be the same timing and they can benefit from doing it at the same time. There is underground and road work at the same time. My understanding tonight is that the vote is not for the whole project just the streetscapes. Lanes down to three, wider sidewalks.
- Jessica Kane, 2455 Kujawa Road: I whole heartedly support the downtown project. I think we've seen so much of a push for placemaking by Governor Snyder's office because he sees we need creative, innovative communities in order to survive. And I hope that I am here 5 years from now, and I hope that Gaylord can decide to be a creative, innovative community that adopts this streetscape project.

- Ed Schrader, 246 West Main Street: Main Street Shoes are gone. Rustic Den is gone. G Wilikers is gone. Storefronts empty. We need to do something or we are going to be boarded up. The economic reality is that downtown is struggling. There are more stores going out of business. Need to be a change. I put my time, my health and my money into renovating my building. If it doesn't turn around I'm not going to stay here. I will go to a community that wants to grow, that wants to develop something, that wants to take a risk. If you don't take risk, you will get no reward. I do not say it will work 100% or that it will fail 100% because there are no guarantees. But I can tell you right now that it is not working and we can't keep going the way we are going.
- Rudi Edel, 5234 Seymore Road: For the last year I have followed letters in the paper. Read letters on change. Some for some against the project. Not enough to sway me one way or another. Last year during late summer, early fall I took a trip Mackinac City, two trips to Boyne City. On the way to the grandkids northwest of Grand Rapids I took a side trip to Holland. All three communities when I was there I was absolutely surprised how the business section bustling. There were people all over the place downtown. It is true that Gaylord currently has five physical lanes but only 3 effective lanes. Ask yourself where do you drive. Do you drive the outside lanes or the inside lanes. I suggest most of us in the room drive the inside lanes which violates state law but do it for safety reasons because how many times have you had to hit the brakes and swerve to the left to avoid hitting a car door. I would like to see government deficits go down, especially at the federal level, but I also understand what a designated fund is. These dollars for streetscapes are designated and going to be spent on streetscapes and if we don't apply it will go to another community in Michigan. We need to be out there and grab that money. Two years ago Sandy and I went camping out west for several weeks. We planned on driving through Rapid City. They have a unique non water streetscape. It was so unique that Sandy and I stopped and parked and shopped for hours. As a community if we do not do something as other people indicated tourism is going to fall. Gaylord has something that other communities don't. We have location. We are at the intersection of 32 and 75 and 3 ½ hours from every major metropolitan area in the state. This is where people also come to visit. I support this project and I urge Mr. Mayor and the Council to also support it.
- Janice Lampert, 524 Dixon Lake Road: I would like to thank you all for listening to the comments and to the Renaissance Committee for all their labor. I imagine it is tough for you as the City Council to come up with another great plan to create a sense of place. What are the ways we can improve our area. How can we create a sense of place. I am so excited that so many people are willing to help, hop on board and become part of a team. The collaboration of energy where people who are tired of being victimized by a poor economy we have a chance now to enhance what we have. We have so many things, we have the Pavilion, the Farmers Market. I encourage you to vote to approve this and build on what we already have. It is not just about money, there is a cost, it is about vision too. And I encourage you to make it part of your vision too.
- Chris Cherry, 117 West Sixth Street: I understand the concerns about safety. Across from me is a rental which the police stop at on a regular basis. Next door to me also is a rental that the police also stop at on a regular basis. The rental behind them not so much. I understand that nobody wants to get hit. We don't want to put up boards on the downtown, but behind them we are putting up boards. We are putting up boards on our residents. The locals can't come and shop here and this is why, we have no foundation. Our foundation is slipping away. I understand how everyone is up for change but let's not do something just for the sake of doing something. Put our

foundation back to where it belongs so we can actually start making something and generating wealth here in Gaylord or we're not going to make it and it won't matter what we do to downtown because if people behind the downtown can't support downtown than there really is no point.

- Paul Beachnau, 586 Sunshine Lane, Executive Director of the Gaylord Area Chamber of Commerce and Tourism Bureau: On behalf of the Chamber of Commerce Board of Directors and over 500 members we strongly encourage and support the Gaylord Renaissance Project brought before you here this evening. A few people have overlooked that a comprehensive quality of life survey was done in 2011 that really targeted our entire community and looked at what were some of the primary concerns. When you look at what those concerns were the top three concerns were, sustainable jobs, unemployment and the ability for people to pay rent. This is an economic development project and not just for the downtown businesses but the ability to attract and recruit new business and new industry. There is a lot of growth and high tech people who can move anywhere. Where do they move? They move to hip, cool, positive communities. Not saying Gaylord is not a cool, hip community but it would be a different cool with this project. But it is really a place where people can hang out, enjoy being together. We were just at a Comprehensive Michigan Tourism Conference and the best speaker there talked about new trends and what visitors are looking for. Authentic, unique, local experiences. This project is all those to a T. Our tourism industry is very good, we had a record growth year last year but no matter how you slice it the top recreational activity of visitors is shopping and we really need to enhance that experience and we need to make a better shopping experience and I would ask you please to endorse this project that has been worked on so hard by so many.
- Dana Bensinger, 4688 Nowak Road: I came across an article today about placemaking and economic development. The title is Placemaking and Economic Development Strategy. This article I would be happy to share it with anyone. It compares the old economy to new economy. There are several points, I would like to touch on a few. In the old economy attracting companies was key. In the new economy attracting educated people is key. In the old economy a high quality, physical environment was a luxury in the way of attracting cost conscious businesses. In the new economy physical and cultural amenities are key in attracting knowledgeable workers. In the new economy success equals organizations and individuals with the ability to learn and adapt. I could go on and on and I would be happy to share with article with anyone. As a mother, a professional, a wife and a citizen I strongly urge you to vote in favor of this project.
- Scott White, 2151 Old State Road, 100-104 West Main Street, 103-107 North Center Avenue: I have had the privilege of investing my blood, sweat and tears and money into Gaylord. It's a wonderful community. However you still need to keep on moving forward. A notion that we need studies to tell us what loud is, you know. You're at an airport you hear a plane going over you know it is loud. You're sitting in the corner of my building which is on the corner of North Center and 32 you don't need a decibel meter to tell you the windows are shaking because of one truck barreling through. Just like Chad I don't walk across the street to go to the bank. I get in my car and drive. You can sit there and watch people trying to cross and I watch in horror. I get nervous thinking is this going to be the day I watch somebody get tattooed walking across the street by a car. I was excited when I saw what I saw today. So I hope that you make me proud of continuing to invest in this community. Just as so many people here have. I think it is a win win for everybody. I encourage a yes vote.

- Janet Flint, 217 East Sheldon Street: I am one of those seniors. I walk downtown every single day. I walk across the street, I feel perfectly safe. I know everyone is going on about how dangerous the downtown is, honestly it's just laughable. If you want to fix up downtown I can understand it, it needs sprucing up. But to tell me it is dangerous to walk downtown, I was on the walkability audit and he said our sidewalks were wide enough. I am sure you all heard that. Mostly there is nobody on the sidewalks. Got nice music going, I enjoy my walk everyday downtown. And the fact that some of you say you can't control your kids downtown. Don't people control their kids any more. I had toddlers. I walked them downtown. I didn't let them walk out in front of a car. But what is really dangerous for your little three year old if you don't watch him is that cement river. I love Gaylord and want the downtown to be fixed up, but I think your just jumping into something because other towns have done it without much thought. It won't be the first time you done something crazy like that half brick half cement sidewalk that every town has that is kind of uneven.
- Joe Marsiglia, 2176 Birch Manor Drive: I am probably one of the only people who came here tonight decidedly undecided about the project. But after seeing everything that was presented and following a little bit on Facebook. First of all kudos to the Committee who put this together. Basically the way I see it is the Council has been presented with a strategic level plan that is looking towards the next 25 years as Mr. Doumas said. I think it is looking towards the next 25 years and beyond. As I said I came in here undecided, I think it is a good idea. Looking towards the future. Gaylord is a great place, there is a lot to do here. This will simply enhance that. Those of us that have seen Field of Dreams If you build it they will come. I think that is pretty applicable in this situation. If you build this I think it is going to be good for the community. I really was heartened by it is not going to cost me or the taxpayers any money. That is really one of the deciding factors. I think you have a great plan, a great vision and I hope the Council sees it that way and supports this thing.
- Kyle Johnston, 865 Krystal Meadow Lane: I actually came in like him mostly undecided, I was actually leaning towards against and after reviewing everything you guys put together tonight, a great amount of work, I am leaning much more towards supporting it. I am not sold yet. I still have some concerns and if you guys can put together some real solid communication addressing those concerns I think it will go a long way in addressing everyone else's as well. It feels like when you are driving downtown that you really need the space that we have, we really need these five lanes, how are we going to possibly shrink it down. And studies say what we have right now is significantly more than what we need. Need to communicate that a little more affectively. I don't understand, I can't wrap my mind around it. How is it going to work, how are we going to be able to fit that same amount of traffic. Studies say we can, explaining that a little more effectively might be useful. I am still concerned about the rent going up and ultimately driving out businesses. I think if there was a way to address that it would go a long way. The more I saw of the water features and the way that it really will make a place I really think that is a very valid idea. Thank you very much for all your efforts.
- Sue Moore, 2527 Manorwood Drive: I absolutely had no intention of getting up here but when I saw former students in the room over there and as I look around the room. I have been an educator in Otsego County for 35 years. And I see so many of my former students and I am listening to my former students come up here. They have come back to Gaylord when they probably couldn't wait to get out. And yet here they are and they are standing in front of you the

leaders of our community and I am listening to parents of current students. This is what we hope for in our community. It is to have these kids come back and make our community better and you're all so very well spoken and you're passionate about your town. Thank you, thank you, thank you so much and please never stop stepping up here and talk about your town and want to make it better. The passion you are showing is so remarkable. Thank you because you will move forward and you will continue to make this the place you want it to be.

- Judy Duhoski, 214 East Sheldon Street: I have some concerns. I have heard that the last millage we voted for on streets, that part of that would go towards this streetscape. Is this true or not? We voted to have our streets fixed and I can name you quite a few streets that are horrible. And you can go by where I live and half the time after we have rain you can put a row boat in. I have been there over 20 years and I am still waiting. People vote for this millage and the streets don't get fixed. North Street from the tracks to Ohio Street was supposed to be done 10 years ago. We are still waiting. And the other thing are these bumpouts and little islands, are they handicap accessible? Can you roll a wheelchair on them? I will tell you what, your sidewalks that are half pavers and half cement are terrible to push a wheelchair down. Terrible. It is very hard. I don't bother bringing my daughter down here anymore, because I cannot push her. As far as safety, opening your door I have been driving for over 50 years not once have I been hit, my door hasn't been taken off. You have to use common sense. That is why they put rearview mirrors on.
- Tony Sharkey, 1412 Washington: I grew up in Gaylord, went off into the military and I came back and brought my family. My 20+ years spent in the military most of it was in government contracting. And there is a few things I learned along the way. One of them is the life cycle cost of any project, doesn't matter if it is a building or an aircraft carrier, airplane or base, 65% of the cost comes after you build it. I look at the numbers up there and the construction cost and I am really taken aback frankly at the lack of attention that has been paid to backend costs. In the military we discovered it didn't matter what kind of project you were talking about. 65%. \$4.5-million dollar project you are talking about \$2.5 million in operating costs. If we are talking about a 10 year life cycle we are talking about \$250,000 a year. Now you are going to come up with \$250,000 extra addition in taxes a year to pay for this. I don't know. But what you are going to do probably is take that amount of time and effort away from other things, snowplows. You are going to take it away from services already provided. I think really before you vote yes on a project like this consider all the costs, look at options. The people who are paying are not the ones who can afford it.
- Jim Flint, 217 East Sheldon Street: I share two capacities, one as a private citizens and one as representing an individual who asked me to speak on her behalf. At this time Mr. Flint read a letter on behalf of in opposition of the project from Stephanie Jacobson, 1325 South Otsego Avenue. The letter was made part of the public record as a written communication.
- Mary Sanders, 7200 Hayes Tower Road: I came to Gaylord a long time ago. I am proud to be a part of the community for all these years. I choose to stay here, I am involved here. I am on a lot of different committees, I've been on a lot of boards. I've been at a lot of workshops. I've learned about a lot of things. We learn from the past, we live for today and we prepare for the future and that is what we are doing here today. We are preparing for the future. When I first came here in the 60's there was no stoplight here. I have loved being here. I have had opportunities perhaps where I could have moved closer to family but I have chosen to stay here because I am proud to be here. I am proud of the associations, I am proud of the people who have gathered together

to make sure we have a university center, to make sure we have a Sportsplex, to make sure we have all those wonderful things that gives us this great quality of life that we have come to expect. I hope they can support this project and see it through its fruition. The Committee has done a marvelous job. Now it is time to take another giant step forward and make this great for our next generation.

- Staci Shafto, 1724 Poquette Road, Isabella's Copper Pot: First of all to address the question about a downtown that does not have water that is thriving. We had a store in Plymouth, Michigan. That is an example of an amazing downtown with visionary leaders and citizens and thriving. Probably along the lines of Traverse City. And no water. Tourism in Michigan is a billion dollar plus industry. The question is Gaylord going to participate in that industry. We've heard all kinds of facts on how things are changing. We are not looking for the next Georgia Pacific to come in necessarily but we do know people are spending money on the tourism industry. I hear a lot of negativity in this room about downtown that I just don't agree with. I still love downtown Gaylord. I love eating at Diana's, I love walking to the shops, I love going to Saturn Booksellers. I love that when Isabella gets home from school or to the store she can go to the Chocolate Haus for an ice cream cone and I love our farmer's market. I do think we have a safety issue. I do fear for myself and my children crossing the road and it is not because my children are not under control. I urge you our City Council to recognize that you are representing us as business owners and citizens and taxpayers and parents to take us into the next stage of being here economically. We are trusting you with the decision tonight to help us live in this community and thrive in this community. And people say this is only benefits businesses. When the businesses thrive the schools thrive. When the schools thrive our children thrive. When our children thrive our families thrive. And that is what this is all about. I urge you to vote yes on behalf of all the people in this room.
- Susan Nowak, 4392 Nowak Road, Homespun Antiques and Crafts: I am very proud to have a business in downtown Gaylord. And there are a lot of other business owners here who are proud to have a business in downtown Gaylord. Apparently what we are doing is not good enough. But we'll keep striving to do better. Sitting in the room I have heard a lot of public comments, some that I didn't agree with and some that I am sure other people didn't agree with. We weren't rude, we didn't snicker and we didn't make nasty noises. We might not have applauded but we weren't nasty. There have been a couple people up here who have spoken against this and I have heard rude nasty snickers, comments. We deserve as much respect as you do. I am not in favor of this. I am in favor of something, we need to do something to help revitalize downtown Gaylord. I have heard many comments that it is not going to affect the taxes and we are not going to be taxed. There is a big fear out there that yes we are. I recently was in a meeting where they talked about the Sportsplex. That was initially, people were lead to believe that that wasn't going to be on the tax roll. And now there is a plan to get that going so are we going to hear in 20 years that this is going to be on the tax roll and we're going to be taxed. There is a fear that there aren't enough people with enough money to pay for this all the way down the road. I would encourage you to think strongly about some of the reasons for backing off some of your plans. I would really like to see a public referendum to see what all of the residents in Gaylord think, whether they approve this or not.
- Brandi Meisner, 673 Whispering Pines Drive: I was born and raised here in Gaylord and I moved away and I proved the earth is round and came back. And now I find myself in the family business.

We have a 41 year old business. MandM Excavating, and we are dealing with a great deal of change in the transition from one generation to the next. And change is different, it is difficult for everyone. But I believe that my future is better and brighter than my current. I have children and someone mentioned something about butterflies, sunshine, hearts, things like that. That is what drives passion and action and you have to have that in order to move forward with the plan. You have to need objections, you have to need a critical eye. You have to consider all the aspects of the costs of the project and costs during the project and costs after the project. However we also have to be a hope filled society. If we aren't then we will just crumble up and shrivel away and die. I support the project, the vast majority of my employees signed a document as well in support of the project and I am happy to present that to you. And I urge you all to do the same. Be brave, be courageous and be hopeful.

- James Flint, 217 East Sheldon Street: I have two documents I would like Council to consider. Safety and Operational Analysis of a 4-lane to 3-Lane Conversions (Road Diets) in Michigan by the Michigan Department of Transportation. I would like to draw your attention to page 48 and 49 of this document. The second document is Evaluation of Pedestrian Related Roadway Measures: A Summary of Available Research. I'd like to draw your attention to page 27 through 35 and request that these be made part of the formal parts of this record of the public hearing today. The reason that this is important these are studies that the Committee for the project say that they support as the basis for their study and their findings. If anything this project if you incorporate it will make the town less safe. But you got to read the documents. If speed and walkability are not really the issues which those documents suggest why is the DDA so much in favor of such a project? I suggest it is greed. The DDA has done façade improvements, rental improvements, now we being asked to pay for improvements so their property taxes can go up and they can increase rental rates, that's what the documents say, the documents they published. And the real problem here is that 50% of the population of Gaylord has incomes of \$27,000. The reason people aren't spending money in Gaylord is because they don't have any discretionary income. Look at the charts, we have downplayed all the expenses. You've got to get discretionary income up in this community that is the real problem. And this project doesn't address it.
- Mark Mulka, 302 East First Street: I am encouraged to see the business people here. I think it is great thing for them to have. We want businesses in town to do good, we want people that are one block over to be safe. Just want you to think about people living in town.
- Brian Morgan, 337 North Estates Drive: I don't live in the City of Gaylord but I have lived here all my life and have a connection to the community. If this project is approved is there going to be any way for local citizens to impact the plan. It will be drawn up by architects and engineers. Will we be able to tweak the plan going forward? I think that it is something that could really divide a community like this. Nice to know if it was approved there was some way that further public input would be accepted.
- Tammy LaBouef, 333 East Felshaw Street: As a person who takes care of a disabled mother who is on a fixed income. Everybody talks about we don't worry about the cost we need to worry about the safety. Well if you are worried about your children you need to worry about what happens when the DDA can't pay back the bonds. The State statute for DDA's say that if the DDA cannot pay their bonds then the State will make the bondholders whole and then your children's school tax revenues will be seized and paid back the State so the bonds are made whole. So if you are worried about your kids worry about your kid's education. This project has direct impact

on your kid's education if the DDA cannot pay back these bonds. The transportation hasn't been asked how this will impact the school bus routing system. I've asked what interest rates are going to be, they don't know. And they won't come clean and tell you how the studies show this project will hamper the of our community if there are more than 10,000 cars. Mr. Burchett says the streets hold 15,000-20,000 cars. This project will negatively impact community. This project will not create family sustainable jobs in our community. I am 100% against this project. Speaking for my disabled mother she is against this project. I think you should look at the facts and not worry so much about feelings.

- Larry Corell, P.O. Box 31, 49751: I have been a property owner in Gaylord for about 40 years. I retired as Gaylord's Transportation Director so I have some knowledge of busing. A man by the name of Frank Lloyd Wright, an architect, wrote a book, "There is Nothing Common About Common Sense". It is amazing to me the number of normal and average citizens I talk to about the streetscape they say what are you talking about. What are they going to do? I start out by saying they are going to move 5 lanes down to 3, and they say who thought of that. Perhaps they can be excused because they are too busy taking care of their affairs. My point is you are using funds from someone else for this project. I suspect you're intent on passing the bill, the proposal. That's what happened with the DDA Board. Heard the comments, let's take up the resolution and let's pass it. I hope that is not true, but if it is the people will have to deal with it.
- Katherine Richter, 709 Clover Drive: I came tonight because I am a citizen, have been voting. First of all I want to thank the people elected in front of us and I pray for you. I want to encourage those out there to pray too. I came because I heard 5 lanes to 3 and I said you have got to be kidding me. So I came tonight to my own shame, I should have been coming all these years. I am not going to say yes and I am not going to say no. But I am going to say that I am going to pray for you. What we have here is precious and you can't get it anywhere else in the world. I hope to be part of this community for a long, long time.
- Jill Miner, 157 Highpointe Lane: I want to stress really quickly I do own a building and a business downtown and I don't feel like this is a move to sustain my business in any way. I think that is my problem. If I can't attract traffic to my store than I don't deserve to be there. If I am not there and I have to board up my building in the middle of Main Street, then that is what happens when I fail. But what I do think is that we owe each other, I owe you, you owe me to make this the best community that we can be. And I think this initiative is about economic development and I agree with the people that have gone before me. And I think the idea is if rents go up and we force people out of our downtown, if we cannot fill our buildings at \$6.00 square foot then there is no universe where we are going to fill them at unless we are doing really, really well. And if we do we are generating revenue for all the projects that everybody wants. I would urge you to please vote yes.
- Al Boughner, 6295 Sparr Road: Been around 42 years, never left. I don't think it is about the rent, \$6.00 a square foot or whatever. I want to stick with the common sense. I totally am neutral, I don't have a say in this. I don't live in the City. I do plow the State highway from Gaylord to Vienna. I am not sure how that is going to work with the County. I am concerned with how trucks coming off 75 are going to get to Alpena, because they are still going to say it is only two blocks. I can get through there. That's my concern, how safe is that going to be. There are a lot of hidden issues and I am not sure how the County is going to support the traffic around and how the residents are going to support the traffic around. I am all for the project though, I know a lot of

my peers have put their heart and soul in this. I hope we can get some better stores downtown because I don't like to shop anywhere else.

Being there was no further public comment, Mayor Jenkins closed the public hearing at 9:52 p.m.

During the Public Comment portion of the meeting, Jim Flint, 217 East Sheldon Street, requested City Council consider passage of a series of motions relating to the Downtown Renaissance Streetscape and City Council policies. Motions presented to City Council include:

- Motion to table this project until August when the public as a whole can vote by referendum on the project.
- Motion to table pending the return of Bill Wishart, who has previously claim that he would not support the spending of any taxpayer funds being used by the Streetscape Project.
- Motion to table pending all city council members provide contact numbers and addresses so that the public can contact them prior to any Agenda Items coming before the council.
- Motion for equal time should the proponents of the project be given time in excess of two minutes to speak to why the project should be approved, then opponents should also be given equal time to oppose the project otherwise the City of Gaylord may be in violation of Title VI.
- Motion to disqualify any City Council members who actively served upon the Gaylord Downtown Renaissance Streetscape Project Committee as being biased and against the general welfare of the public.
- Motion to table any vote on the project upon such time as decision makers vote on whether or not the project addresses a public need rather than benefits only downtown businesses.
- Motion to support alternative streetscape solutions that are more cost effective, enforcement of speed laws as is done in Mancelona, painting crosswalks, and implementation of low cost alternatives suggested by MDOT's walkability expert.
- Motion to do a traffic study with reduced lanes by using traffic cones and/or paint before we approve the project and tear up Main Street.
- Motion to table the project vote until such time that the Project addresses in detail how they plan to protect existing businesses that are on the financial edge of going under while construction is undertaken.

City Council declined to take any action on the requests.

After discussion by City Council Members, the following resolution was brought to the table.

Motion by Duczkowski, supported by Sharrard, **WHEREAS**, the key to a successful community is a strong and vibrant downtown; and, **WHEREAS**, it is recognized that the critical elements necessary for any downtown to prosper include being pedestrian friendly and walkable, clean and safe, multifunctional, with broad public and private investment to establish it as a destination and to create a sense of place; and, **WHEREAS**, the Gaylord Renaissance Project Steering Committee, comprised of a diverse array of individuals from across the community, have developed a concept plan to revitalize the downtown to achieve these goals; and, **WHEREAS**, the concept plan calls for reducing the number of traffic lanes, adding bumpouts, pedestrian safety islands, trees, plantings, information kiosks, and creating a unique central park plaza around the County Courthouse; and, **WHEREAS**, it is believed that if implemented the plan would calm traffic, reduce air and noise pollution and create a desired business environment as well as a destination for visitors and locals alike through beautification and amenities, in a safe, clean and attractive

environment; and, **WHEREAS**, the Gaylord Downtown Renaissance Concept Plan is not inconsistent with the goals identified in the Downtown Development Authority Development, the City of Gaylord Master Plan and the County of Otsego Master Plan; and, **WHEREAS**, the Gaylord Downtown Development Authority has gone on record strongly supporting the Gaylord Downtown Renaissance Concept Plan and its implementation and requested that the City of Gaylord support the project and its implementation as well as serve as the applicant for state and federal funds. **THEREFORE, BE IT RESOLVED** that the Gaylord City Council supports the Gaylord Downtown Renaissance Concept Plan and its implementation and agrees to serve as the grant applicant for state and federal funds needed to implement those portions of the project that are within the jurisdictional control of the City of Gaylord.

Ayes: Unanimous. Motion carried. Resolution declared adopted.

Motion by Johnson, supported by Mankowski, to accept the proposal of American Waste for the 2014 Spring Clean-Up at a cost of \$65.35 per compacted cubic yard.

Ayes: Unanimous. Motion carried.

Motion by Duczkowski, supported by Sharrard, to approve the 2014 Alpenfest Street Closing, Alpenfest Walking Parade and Alpenfest Grand Parade, as presented.

Ayes: Unanimous. Motion carried.

Motion to adjourn.

Meeting adjourned at 10:25 p.m.

Rebecca Curtis, City Clerk

John Jenkins, Mayor